

**Etna Community Association
2 Lower Creek Road
Etna, New York 13062**

RECEIVED

2011 SEP 23 P 12: 29

Secretary of the Commission
Postal Regulatory Commission
901 New York Avenue NW
Suite 200, West Tower
Washington, DC 20268

Received

SEP 21 2011

POSTAL REGULATORY
COMMISSION
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

Office of PAGR

September 20, 2011

Dear Madam Secretary:

Regarding the Decision by the US Postal Service to close the Etna, New York Post Office.

We, members of the Etna Community Association Board of Directors and other residents of Etna, are writing to appeal the determination by the USPS to close the Etna, New York Post Office, docket number 1362780 -13062, and request the Postal Regulatory Commission to review this decision. We feel this decision was made arbitrarily and long before any input was gathered from the community itself. We feel the determination was made without regard to the best interests of the community, and was based entirely on the economic concerns of the Postal Service in direct opposition to the Postal Regulatory Act of 1970. We feel that the consolidation of the Etna Post office is unsupported by substantial evidence on the record.

1. While the total office receipts have declined since Fiscal Year 2010, it should be pointed out that the most significant drop in revenue took place after the retirement of the postmaster and her replacement by temporary officers-in-charge. The Postal Service listed the postmaster vacancy as a reason for closure in their final determination. However, the responsibility for not appointing a new postmaster in a timely fashion rests entirely with the USPS, rendering the closure action prejudicial and arbitrary. We understand the financial difficulties of the US Postal Service and today's economic realities, however we feel closing a small post office the size of Etna's is akin to trying to lighten a jet airliner by emptying the ash trays. According to the National League of Postmasters in a Business Wire article of September 15, 2011, rural post offices comprise about 0.7% of the USPS total expenses.

2. A meeting was arranged with postal officials at the office on May 5, 2011. There was no support whatsoever for closure of the post office from the 32 Etna residents and representatives of the local business community in attendance. Questionnaires were mailed to 159 residents, and of those returned expressing an opinion, the count was 35 opposed to the closing to 6 favorable responses. On July 18, the Postal Service received a petition supporting the retention of the post office from 260 area residents, a number exceeding to an impertinent extent the number of questionnaires mailed.

3. We are also concerned about the lack of clear communications regarding alternate services:

1- Exactly which post office will offer post office boxes for those that will be lost in Etna and

at what cost? No input from the Ithaca post office, which serves half of the Etna community, has been mentioned.

2- Rural carriers will not provide the 9:30 a.m. mail pickup time that customers now have at the current post office, a problem for business customers and residents who need mail delivered in a timely fashion.

3- There seems to be no concern that the Freeville post office currently closes at 4:45 p.m. and not at 5:30 p.m. as in Etna, causing another inconvenience for customers that work regular hours.

4- No mention was made of changes in box rental fees. A portion of the boxes in Etna are provided at no charge to some customers and there was no mention of continuation of this service.

5- There is no provision for the inclusion of both Ithaca and Freeville rural delivery routes that currently service the Etna Community.

6- We have a number of senior citizens who are within walking distance of the post office now, but will not be if it is closed. We also have a concern for those who do not have internet access, cannot take advantage of the USPS online services, and require assistance with parcel mailing, money orders, and special needs that a small post office provides.

7- We feel that customers concerns over mail security have not been fully addressed. Mailboxes in the area are subject to theft, vandalism, and damage by snowplows, traffic and the vagaries of the weather.

4. While Etna has no retail storefronts other than the post office itself, the determination by the USPS that there is no business activity here is misleading or flatly incorrect. A partial list of businesses and organizations that use the Etna post office on a regular basis would include: The Boy Scouts of America, Sea Scouts, Academic Book Source, Phoenix Books, Tompkins Weekly, Ithaca Child, Gary Rith Pottery, Bo's Bones, Crackerman of Etna, Autoworks, Cornell University, National Audubon Society, NCSC (Terri Vantine), Wildtree Herbs (Heather Marshall), Hawkeye's Herbs, Tabby Bookkeeping, CNY Landscaping, Etna Community Church, Etna Community Association, FSM Sharpening, Etna Fire Company, J. Lowery Co, C Mark Enterprises, Bill Lowe Welding, If Only Farm, Creekwood Apartments, and Scrub Oak Farms. The closing proposal stated there were no churches or schools nearby, apparently failing to notice that the post office shares its parking lot with the Etna Community Church.

5. No mention was made that the Etna Post office occupies a part of Houtz Hall, which is the historic and social center of the hamlet and used by the Boy Scouts, the Etna Community Church and other organizations in addition to the Etna Community Association. In a small neighborhood where news coverage is sparse by the usual media channels, it serves as a face-to-face meeting place and news dissemination point for nearly the entire community, and depends to a great extent on the daily traffic generated by the presence of the US Post Office, an institution in Etna since 1823 and the only federal presence here. The Etna Post Office has provided the community with far more than just postal services for many years, and serves as the hub of this unincorporated hamlet as well as providing a substantial part of the community identity.

6. While the determination to close the Etna post office included an annual savings breakdown including the postmaster salary and benefits and the \$4,480 annual lease agreement, there was no itemized listing of the cost of replacement service of \$22,713, which would have to be an estimate since the number of postal customers that would opt for rural delivery has not yet been determined. In addition, the Postal Service will not be eliminating any positions directly, but transferring employees to other postal facilities. Post office boxes continue to be the most secure and efficient method of mail distribution for a small

community, a single postal employee requiring only a matter of a few minutes to distribute incoming mail as opposed to the hours it would require for a rural carrier even under ideal traffic and weather conditions.

7. In brief, we feel that the USPS has underestimated the impact on the Etna community, not considered the prevailing opposition to the closing of the post office, and overestimated the actual annual savings. It is clear to us that the Postal Service has disregarded both the letter and spirit of the law in making its determination to close the post office based solely on financial considerations. We would request that the Postal Regulatory Commission review this determination and either remand it for further consideration, suspend or dismiss it altogether.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

The Etna Community Association Board of Directors

Frank H. Thorne, III 9-19-2011
Frank H. Thorne, President

Stephanie A. Crockett 9.19.11
Stephanie Crockett, Treasurer

Sharon Searles 9-19-2011
Sharon Searles, Board Member

Lawrence A. Beckwith 9/19/2011
Lawrence A. Beckwith, Board Member

Judy Auble-Zazzara 9/19/2011
Judy Auble-Zazzara Postal Customer

Barbara Need 20 Sept 2011
Barbara Need - Postal Customer

MR ED PHELAN
DISTRICT MANAGER
UNITED STATES POSTAL SERVICE
30 KARNER ROAD
ALBANY NY 12288

JULY 13 2011

MR PHELAN

PLEASE FIND ENCLOSED A COPY OF THE PETITION THAT HAS BEEN IN THE ETNA COMMUNITY HALL VESTIBULE SINCE LATE APRIL 2011. THIS IS A SHARED SPACE WITH THE ETNA POST OFFICE. THE SIGNATURES OF CUSTOMERS AND INTERESTED INDIVIDUALS ARE ALSO ENCLOSED ABOUT 290, THE PETITION IS STILL AVAILABLE FOR SIGNING.

THIS REPRESENTS JUST A SMALL NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE POSSIBILITY OF CLOSING THIS OFFICE. ETNA IS A CONVENIENT MAILING AND DELIVERY FACILITY AND A HUB IN OUR COMMUNITY. PLEASE CONSIDER THE CUSTOMERS THAT WILL BE DISPLACED AND HAVE TO TRAVEL TO OBTAIN SERVICE IF ETNA IS CLOSED.

WE HAVE FORWARDED A COPY OF THIS PETITION TO M. KRUL AS SHE WAS THE MANAGER AT THE MEETING HELD IN ETNA ON MAY 5 2011.

SINCERELY,

JUDITH A AUBLE-ZAZZARA FOR:
THE CUSTOMERS OF THE ETNA AREA POST OFFICE
PO BOX 483
ETNA NY 13062

CC M KRUL

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST OFFICE

	DATE	NAME	ADDRESS
1	5/16/11	Josephine Strain	
2	6/29/11	Juane Testat	461
3	6/29/11	Marci Colabattola	
4	6/30/11	Sherry Masely	20
5	7/1/11	Blaine Bowers	150
6	7/2/11	Kailen B. Whitmore	5
7	7/2/11	Jack Seymour	Pl
8	7-5-11	Patsi Stevenson	119
9	7/5/11	Likelihood	
10	7/5/11	Larry Van Etter	
11	7/6/11	Carol Kossone	
12	7/6/11	Thena Gitlin	
13	7/6/11	John W. Nixon	
14	7/6/11	Scott Nuyet	
15	7/9/11	Kyle Allington	
16		Jolene Lyon	
17	7/7/11	Jean Keech	
18	7/7/11	Shirley Lyon	
19	7/7/11	Gerald Lyon	
20	7/2/11	Robert Shebrone	
21		Redmond	
22	7/9/11	Jennifer Romano	
23	7/11/11	Linda J. Van	
24	2/11/11	Shannon Humphrey	
25	7/11/11	CORINNE CURIA	

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

DATE NAME ADDRESS

26	5/26/11	Thomas Bonn	
27	5/27/11	Trace Jones	92
28	5/27/11	T - S	
29	5/31/11	Virginia Cole	
30	6/1/11	Joe Goodspeed	
31	6/1/11	Frank + Suzanne	
32	6-2-11	Robt Jones	11
33	6/2/11	Justin Coats	79
34	6/3/2011	Diane Tenaglia-Hyp	
35	6/5/2011	Maryline Powell	E
36	6/6/11	Robert A. Montone	
37	6/6/11	Donna S. Vantine	
38	6/6/11	Nancy B. Huffman	
39	6/6/11	Sonya Lawlis	1
40	6/7/11	Cynthia Mairzer	
41	6/7/11	William A. Davis	
42	6/7/11	William Davis	
43	6/7/11	A. Tenaglia	
44	6/7/11	Cena Gray	8
45	6/8/11	JOEL CADDBURY	B
46	6/8/11	WINSTON SOTO	
47	6/8/11	Thomas	
48	6/8/11	Isidoro Videncio	
49	6/8/11	Calby Cruzes	
50	6/9/2011	Scott Luke	2185 1

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

DATE NAME ADDRESS

26	Michael Resever	1751 Dr
27	Patrick Moore	49 Speed
28	Rachel Moore	11
29	20 ROBERT TAYLOR	408
30	Carol Glidden	97 S
31	Jan Glidden	7 SWSET
32	Jacoby Brown	4
33	Karl Potter	Box 206
34	Chris Mitchell	22 Lesim Ln
35	Kathy Munn	99 Wood
36	Kathy Cole	9 E Wood
37	Kristina	2
38	DAE CASER	8/25/11 46 W
39	Carl Caser	6/27/11 46 W
40	Kathryn Wilk	334
41	John Baker	1 E
42	Shirley	708 Pa
43	Sonja Wixom	2
44	Beverly Cornelia	
45	Maureen Dickey	5/28/11
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

DATE NAME ADDRESS

26	5/16/11	Sonya Lewis	120 Wc
27	10 MAY 2011	Charles Southworth	603 W
28	5/16/11	Wayde Southworth	61
29	5/16/11	Scott M. Blush	61
30	2/16/11	John CROCICETTI	50
31	5/17/11	Jamie J. Parsons Janice Parsons	16
32	5/18/11	FRANK J. SCOTT SR.	9
33	5/18/11	Barbara Shigwo	2.
34	5/18/11	Karen Linge	9.
35	5/18/11	Dona D. Peronin	
36	5-19-11	Joi. Mulcahy	15
37	5-19-11	Wayne Richards	13
38	5/20/11	Marquitta Crawford	2
39	5/21/11	Robert M. Dostal (Pasta)	9
40	5/21/11	Stacie Kropp	"
41	5/21/11	Robert Brackett	
42	5/24/11	Diane Purnell	
43	5-25-11	Douglas J. Boye	:
44	5-27-11	Charles W. Davis	
45	5-24-11	John Z. Brown	
46	5-25-11	Bill Beck	
47			
48			
49			
50			

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

DATE NAME ADDRESS

26	5/6/11	Kristi M
27	5/6/11	Lois SWALE
28	5/6/11	Jane Peck
29	5/6/11	Justin Scott
30	5/6/11	Jane Peck
31	5/6/11	John P. Casper
32	5/6/11	John P. Casper
33	5/7/11	Aleta C. Jersey
34	5/7/11	Diane Jansaglia
35	5/7/11	ETNA Vol. Fire 2
36	5/7/11	Dan Hubbard Box
37	5/7/11	David McGraw 39
38	5/7/11	DONNA S. VANTINE
39	5/9/11	Shondra Taylor
40	5/10/11	Leela Noronha
41	5/11/11	Lillian Broomfield
42	5/11/11	Robert Broomfield
43	5/12/11	Christine Usher
44	5/12/11	Mary Bl
45	5/12/11	Stephanie Betts
46	5/14/11	M. P. Rousy
47	5/14/11	Benjamin Jones
48	5/14/11	Colleen Richards
49	5/16/11	Sally Footman
50	3/16/14	STANLEY MARCUS 10

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST OFFICE

DATE NAME ADDRESS

26	5/5	Frank Ford
27	5/5	Lisa Ford
28	5/5	Wanda Drieksc
29	5/5	Heidi Lick-Greay
30	5/6	Cecily Roman
31	5/5	Jan George Sage
32	"	Michael Branc
33	5/5	Lynal Speer
34	5/5	Carol J Colfer
35	5/5	ROSAUE BORZIK
36	5/5	Janina Brown
37	5/5	Charles Davis
38	5/5	JOHN LONG
39	5/5	Brian O'Carle
40	5/5	Colby Pace
41	5/5	Josh Dwyer
42	5/5	London [unclear]
43	5/5	Tom [unclear]
44	5/6	Gene Walker
45	5/6	Cyddie Smith
46	5/6	MATTEA McConnell
47	5/6	Tomas Jones
48	5/6	John Francis Smith [unclear]
49	5/7	Chuck [unclear]
50	5/7	Bill & Carol [unclear]

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST OFFICE

DATE NAME ADDRESS

26	30 APR 11	MEGAN WITMAN P
27	30 APRIL	KAREN BIDDINGER
28	30 Apr.	Clarence Anderson
29	30	PAT KANE
30	30 APR 11	JEFF DIVER I
31	30 April	Nathaniel Katsiane
32	3 May	Carol Nelson
33	2 May	Joseph Ripchik
34	2 May	Linda Bayla
35	2 MAY	EDITH SZABO
36	2 May	Laura Daly
37	2 May	Anna C. Cirtia
38	2 MAY	EDITH AIO
39	2 MAY	Frank Aio
40	2 May	Rebekah Smith
41	2 May	John Kingst
42	2 may	Tonia Lieber
43	2 may	Joann Heag
44	2 may	Jean Heag +
45	2 may	Matt Heag
46		Ron Blanchard E
47	2 May	JoAnne Nash
48	2 May	Utami & Martin Lumm
49	5/2/11	Debra Bain
50	5/2/11	John Howley

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

DATE

NAME

ADDRESS

1	4/30/11	cole golman	
2	4/30/11	Catherine Thomas	
3	4/30/11	Rubin Hodge	200
4	4/30/11	Scott Baylor	B
5	4/30/11	Shaunley Baylor	
6	4/30/11	Donald Braxton	
7	4/30/11	Donald Braxton	
8	4/30/11	Shelly Hall	
9	4/30/11	Trevor M. Peys	
10	4/30/11	Jack Siirell	
11	4/30/11	Marci Weyer	
12	4/30/11	James Luck	
13	4/30/11	BRUCE HORNAS	
14	4/30/11	JANET F. GEE	
15	4/30/11	Sharon K. Lindert	
16	4/30/11	Richard Tilton	
17	4/30/11	William De	
18	4/30/11	Kathy Day	
19	4-30-11	Ashley McClain	
20	4-30-11	Cathy Mooney	
21	4-30-11	Carolyn Va	
22	4-30-11	Bob Jones	496
23	4-30-11	Dorothy Poole	
24	4-30-11	Teri Vanti	
25	4/30/11	Paul Allen	P

DATE NAME ADDRESS

26	4/30/11	Gary Rith	M... ..
27	4/30/2011	Mau de Rith	
28	4/30/11	Richard De	
29	4/30/11	Deborah McGraw	
30	4/30/11	Charity	
31			
32			
33			
34	4/30/11	Heather Marshall	
35	4/30/11	Forrest Marshall	
36	4/30/11	Pam Dellaway	
37	4/30/11	Christina May	
38	4/30/11	Rud Loh	
39	4/30/11	Charles Bassard	
40	4/30/11	SHERYL ENGLUND	
41	4/30/11	Robert Zazzara	
42	4/30/2011	Tony Ledner	
43	4/30/2011	Edward Potts	
44	4/30/2011	Cynthia Marquis	
45	4/30/2011	Lawrence + Kathie Beckwith	
46	4/30/2011	Jim Graneys	
47	4/30/2011	Robert Snyder	
48	4/30/2011	Elyse Hill	
49	4/30/2011	Robert Sprinkle	
50	4/30/11	Hank Yalmer	

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

	DATE	NAME	AT
1	4-30-2011	Judith A Able-Zaz	
2	4-30-2011	SAINO ZAZZAI	
3	4-30-2011	Carol Collins	
4	4-30-2011	Robert Gay	
5	4-30-2011	Joseph Chely	
6	4.30.2011	KEVIN SYMONS	
7	4/29	Wendy Collins	
8	4/29	Debbie Wood	
9	4/29	FRANK H. THORNE	
10	4/29	Scott Blackman	
11	4-29	Stephanie Grant	
12	4/29	Sharon Seales	
13	4/29	Robert G. Vontine	
14	4/29	Carnie Baylor	
15	4/29	Shawn Baylor	
16	4/29	Chelsea Gran	
17	4/29	Brennan Bayle	
18	4/29	Matt Grant	
19	4/29	L. Frederick Kide	
20	4/29	SCOTT Blackman	
21	4/30	Yvonne Linggi	
22	4/30	Marjorie B Smith	
23	4/3	Stephen Todd	
24	4/30	Stephanie Crockett	
25	4/30	Pauline Neal	

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

DATE NAME AD

26	7/22/11	ALITHA HOWARD	10
27	7/13/11	Andrea Ryde	7
28	7/13/11	Phyllis Eshel	-
29	7/14/11	Shirley Nero	10
30	7/15/11	Jean Jerome	
31	7/16/11	Sandy Schutt	
32	7/16/11	Cou FARINO	4
33	7/16/11	Candy	
34	7/17/11	Ellie Phillips Budge	
35	7/18/11	Allison PEGUS	530
36	7/18/11	GARY WASH	-
37	7/18/11	LAURA PAKK	
38	7/18/11	ERIK BJARNAR	200
39	7/18/11	Eric BLISS	285
40	7/21/11	Leela Noronha	31
41	7/21/11	Genie HALL	25
42	8/1/2011	JIM GLIDDEN	7SONS
43	8/1/2011	Mary Ann Samner	10
44	8/1/2011	William L. Dinger	
45	8/1/2011	Abbey Alexiades	461
46	8/2/2011	Cauld. Elliden	75
47	8/2/2011	John John Howley	99
48	8/2/2011	TERESA Howley	99 Etn
49	8/2/2011	Moses - Mary Ann	
50	8/9/2011	Marguerite Crawford	35

CUSTOMERS
ETNA N Y

of the
POST

OFFICE

DATE NAME ADI

50	8/13/11	HENRY YOLMAN	150 L
51	8/13/11	cole yolman	150 LOK
52	8/17/11	Erin COX	39 Wood
53	8/17/11	Vanessa Baker Dumont	33
54	8/18/11	Ann-Kathrin Wirth	G. F. Th
55	8/29/11	Kriste front	19 Pica
56	8/29/11	Brian O'Neil	618 W
57	9/1/11	Savages	100 Et
58	9/2/11	Chris West	P.O. Bo
59	9/3/11	Jan G. Sage	P.O. Bo
60	9/3/11	Michael Brandt	Pi
61	9/6/11	William Davis	55.
62	9/6/11	Tracey White	280
63	9/6/11	Helen K Ford	100
64	9/6/11	Tom McConnell	22
65	9/6/11	John Smith-Peter	13 .R
66	9/7/11	Barbara Park	57 Bot
67	9/8/11	Terri Ann Zdanowski	535
68	9/8-11	CAREY A BARKED	
69	9/10/11	Zana Bay	5
70	9/16/11	Linda Bush	30
71	9/19/11	Nancy B. Hoffman	123
72			
73			
74			