

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
POSTAL RATE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, DC 20268-0001

Complaint of Time Warner Inc. et al.
Concerning Periodicals Rates

Docket No. C2004-1

PRESIDING OFFICER'S RULING GRANTING JOINT MOTION
FOR PROTECTIVE CONDITIONS FOR CERTAIN RESPONSES OF WITNESS TANG

(Issued October 14, 2004)

Background. Postal Service witness Tang's testimony (USPS-RT-2) includes rate comparison data for 55 publications. Complainants, in Interrogatory No. 13 (c), (d) and (e) directed to witness Tang, seek more detailed information about this set of publications, as well as comparable information for any expanded set of publications witness Tang may provide in response to Presiding Officer's Information Request (POIR) No. 2, September 23, 2004.

The Postal Service and Complainants jointly seek the establishment of protective conditions for material requested in connection with TW et al./USPS-RT2-13 and with the anticipated expansion of the sample set of publications. Joint Motion of the United States Postal Service and Complainants for the Establishment of Protective Conditions, October 6, 2004 (Joint Motion). In support of this approach, the Joint Motion notes that the Service is concerned that any direct response to the Complainants' request for more detailed information, in conjunction with the expanded sample, might result in public disclosure of information about certain publications that would allow knowledgeable industry observers to identify specific publications. The possibility then arises that specific mail characteristic information could then be tied to those publications and competitive harm could occur. Joint Motion at 1-2.

Given industry practice, Postal Service preferences and the Commission's previous stance on such matters, the Joint Motion proposes production of the requested material subject to protective conditions. The terms therein, provided in an attachment to the Joint Motion, are essentially identical to those adopted in the last rate case (Presiding Officer's Ruling No. R2001-1-/17, December 7, 2001). The attachment includes two certifications: one to be executed upon seeking access to a copy of the protected material and another to be executed upon return or destruction of such material.

Ruling. The Joint Motion provides a reasonable approach to balancing legitimate interest in access to relevant data and information with concerns about protecting unwarranted disclosure of potentially sensitive commercial harm. Given the proven efficacy of this approach and the absence of any objections to its adoption in these circumstances, the Joint Motion is granted. Participants' attention is directed to Condition No. 16, which states that each person desiring to obtain access to the protected material must file advance notice of this intention with the Postal Rate Commission and serve such notice on the Postal Service.

RULING

1. The Joint Motion of the United States Postal Service and Complainants for the Establishment of Protective Conditions, filed October 6, 2004, is granted with respect to any mailer-specific materials filed by the Postal Service in response to:
 - a. the subparts of interrogatory TW et al./USPS-RT2-13 referenced in the body of this ruling; and
 - b. any similar materials used in witness Tang's response to POIR No. 2 and filed within the same data set as the interrogatory 13 materials.

2. The attached set of protective conditions (including certifications), which is identical to that proposed in and attached to the Joint Motion, is hereby adopted for use in this proceeding.

George Omas
Presiding Officer

STATEMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH PROTECTIVE CONDITIONS

The following protective conditions limit access to materials provided in Docket No. C2004-1 by the Postal Service in response to Presiding Officer's Ruling No. C2004-1/11 (hereinafter, "these materials"). Individuals seeking to obtain access to these materials must agree to comply with these conditions, complete the attached certifications, provide the completed certifications to the Commission, and serve them upon counsel for the party submitting the confidential material.

1. Only a person who is either:
 - (a) an employee of the Postal Rate Commission (including the Office of the Consumer Advocate) with a need-to-know; or
 - (b) a participant in Postal Rate Commission Docket No. C2004-1, or a person employed by such participant, or acting as agent, consultant, contractor, affiliated person, or other representative of such participant for purposes related to the litigation of Docket No. C2004-1, shall be granted access to these materials. However, no person involved in competitive decision-making for any entity that might gain competitive advantage from use of this information shall be granted access to these materials. "Involved in competitive decision-making" includes consulting on marketing or advertising strategies, pricing, product research and development, product design, or the competitive structuring and composition of bids, offers or proposals. It does not include rendering legal advice or performing other services that are not directly in furtherance of activities in competition with a person or entity having a proprietary interest in the protected material.
2. No person granted access to these materials is permitted to disseminate them in whole or in part to any person not authorized to obtain access under these conditions.
3. The final date of any participant's access shall be the earlier of:
 - (a) the date on which the Postal Rate Commission issues a recommended decision or otherwise closes Docket No. C2004-1;
 - (b) the date on which that participant formally withdraws from Docket No. C2004-1; or

- (c) the last date on which the person who obtains access is under contract or retained or otherwise affiliated with the Docket No.C2004-1 participant on whose behalf that person obtains access. The participant immediately shall notify the Postal Rate Commission and counsel for the party who provided the protected material of the termination of any such business or consulting arrangement or retainer or affiliation that occurs before the closing of the evidentiary record.
- 4. Immediately after the Commission issues a recommended decision in, or otherwise disposes of, Docket No. C2004-1, a participant (and any person working on behalf of that participant) who has obtained a copy of these materials shall certify to the Commission:
 - (a) that the copy was maintained in accordance with these conditions (or others established by the Commission); and
 - (b) that the copy (and any duplicates) either have been destroyed or returned to the Commission.
- 5. The duties of any persons obtaining access to these materials shall apply to material disclosed or duplicated in writing, orally, electronically, or otherwise, by any means, format, or medium. These duties shall apply to the disclosure of excerpts from or parts of the document, as well as to the entire document.
- 6. All persons who obtain access to these materials are required to protect the document by using the same degree of care, but no less than a reasonable degree of care, to prevent the unauthorized disclosure of the document as those persons, in the ordinary course of business, would be expected to use to protect their own proprietary material or trade secrets and other internal, confidential, commercially sensitive, and privileged information.
- 7. These conditions shall apply to any revised, amended, or supplemental versions of materials provided in Docket No. C2004-1.
- 8. The duty of nondisclosure of anyone obtaining access to these materials is continuing, terminable only by specific order of the Commission, or as specified in paragraphs 10 through 15, below.

9. Any Docket No. C2004-1 participant or other person seeking access to these materials by requesting access, consents to these or such other conditions as the Commission may approve.
10. The Postal Service shall clearly mark the following legend on each page, or portion thereof, that the Service seeks to protect under this agreement: "Confidential-Subject To Protective Conditions In Docket No. C2004-1 Before The Postal Rate Commission" or other markings that are reasonably calculated to alert custodians of the material to its confidential or proprietary nature. Except with the prior written consent of the Postal Service, or as hereinafter provided, no protected information may be disclosed to any person.
11. Any written materials — including but not limited to discovery requests and responses, requests for admission and responses, deposition transcripts and exhibits, pleadings, motions, affidavits, written testimony and briefs — that quote or contain materials protected under these protective conditions are also covered by the same protective conditions and certification requirements, and shall be filed with the Commission only under seal. Documents submitted to the Commission as confidential shall remain sealed while in the Secretary's office or such other place as the Commission may designate so long as they retain their status as stamped confidential documents.
12. Any oral testimony, argument or other statements that quote or otherwise disclose materials protected under these protective conditions shall be received only in hearing sessions limited to Postal Service representatives and other persons who have complied with the terms of the protective order and have signed the attached certifications. The transcript pages containing such protected testimony shall be filed under seal and treated as protected materials under paragraph 11.
13. Notwithstanding the foregoing, protected material covered by paragraphs 11 or 12 may be disclosed to the following persons without their execution of a compliance certificate. Such disclosure shall not exceed the extent necessary to assist in prosecuting this proceeding or any appeals or reconsideration thereof.
 - (a) Members of the Commission.

- (b) Court reporters, stenographers, or persons operating audio or video recording equipment for such court reporters or stenographers at hearings or depositions.
 - (c) Any other person designated by the Commission in the interest of justice, upon such terms as the Commission may deem proper.
 - (d) Reviewing courts and their staffs. Any person seeking to disclose protected information to a reviewing court shall make a good faith effort to obtain protective conditions at least as effective as those set forth in this document. Moreover, the protective conditions set forth herein shall remain in effect throughout any subsequent review unless overridden by the action of a reviewing court.
14. A participant may apply to the Commission for a ruling that documents, categories of documents, or deposition transcripts, stamped or designated as confidential, are not entitled to such status and protection. The Postal Service or other person that designated the document or testimony as confidential shall be given notice of the application and an opportunity to respond. To revoke confidential status, the proponent of declassification must show by a preponderance of the evidence that public disclosure of the materials is consistent with the standards of the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(1)-(9), and Commission precedent.
15. Subpoena by Courts or Other Agencies. If a court or other administrative agency subpoenas or orders production of confidential information which a participant has obtained under the terms of this protective order, the target of the subpoena or order shall promptly (within two business days) notify the Postal Service (or other person who designated the document as confidential) of the pendency of the subpoena or order to allow the designating party time to object to that production or seek a protective order.
16. Each person desiring to obtain access to these materials must file a notice with the Postal Rate Commission listing name, title and position at least one day in advance of the day that the person signs a certification at the Commission's docket section in order to receive a copy of the materials. A copy of the notice must also be served in advance on the Postal Service.

CERTIFICATION

The undersigned represents that:

Access to materials provided in Docket No. C2004-1 by the Postal Service in response to Presiding Officer's Ruling No. C2004-1/11 (hereinafter, "these materials" or "the information") has been authorized by the Commission. The cover or label of the copy obtained is marked with my name. I agree to use the information only for purposes of analyzing matters at issue in Docket No. C2004-1. I certify that I have read and understand the above protective conditions and am eligible to receive access to materials under paragraph 1 of the protective conditions. I further agree to comply with all protective conditions and will maintain in strict confidence these materials in accordance with all of the protective conditions set out above.

Name _____

Firm _____

Title _____

Representing _____

Signature _____

Date _____

CERTIFICATION UPON RETURN OF
PROTECTED MATERIALS

Pursuant to the Certification which I previously filed with the Commission regarding information provided in Docket No. C2004-1 by the Postal Service in response to Presiding Officer's Ruling No. C2004-I/11 (hereinafter, "these materials" or "the information"), received on behalf of myself and/or the party which I represent (as indicated below), I now affirm as follows:

1. I have remained eligible to receive access to materials under paragraph 1 of the protective conditions throughout the period these materials have been in my possession. Further, I have complied with all conditions, and have maintained these materials in strict confidence in accordance with all of the protective conditions set out above.
2. I have used the information only for purposes of analyzing matters at issue in Docket No. C2004-1.
3. I have returned the information to the Postal Rate Commission.
4. I have either surrendered to the Postal Rate Commission or destroyed all copies of the information that I obtained or that have been made from that information.

Name _____

Firm _____

Title _____

Representing _____

Signature _____

Date _____